Provincial Accountability and Governance Project (PAG)

Grant # S-NEAIR-09-CA-126

October 1, 2009 to April 30, 2012

Final Report

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

From October 1, 2009 to April 30, 2012 the Iraq Foundation (IF) implemented the Provincial Accountability & Governance Project (PAG) aimed at strengthening local anti-corruption capacity in 15 provinces: Baghdad, Babil, Wasit, Kirkuk, Salah al Din, Mosul, Karbala, Najaf, Basra, Maysan, Thi-Qar, Muthanna, Diwaniya, Diyala, and Anbar. IF worked in collaboration with a coalition of local CSO partners, civic leaders, provincial and national officials and international experts.

As a direct result of this project, IF trained 570 civic leaders, 450 provincial official leaders and over 1500 Iraqi youth in the Iraqi anti-corruption legal and regulatory framework, the Code of Conduct (CoC) and associated compliance laws, good governance indicators, and the National Anti-Corruption Strategy (NAS) through 34 trainings and workshops. IF’s partner NGOs and Integrity Monitoring Group (IMG) members received training on the anti-corruption networking website, created by IF.

Throughout the project, IF worked closely with the Commission on Integrity (COI). At the beginning of the project, IF purchased and delivered all equipment listed n the US embassy list to the COI aimed at strengthening the COI’s mission to combat corruption. IF also worked with the COI to select trainers for the COC training and civic leaders’ workshops and to identify materials for the workshops.

IF facilitated the creation of 15 citizens watch dog groups, IMGs, to engage in monitoring anti-corruption and transparency and to establish cooperation with other civic groups, the media and the local government. Agendas for Change, drafted by civic leaders as a roadmap for combating corruption in their respective provinces, and were adopted at the provincial level as a monitoring tactic of good governance. The progress of these Agendas was reviewed by 641 IMG members and local stakeholders.
Local IMGs consulted among themselves in monthly meetings 174 times. They met with members of the community and local government in 90 quarterly town hall meetings, during which IMGs presented interim reports on the status of the Agenda for Change in their provinces and invited government officials to discuss the findings and recommendations addressed by the IMGs and the general public. They visited members of the local provincial government 242 times to discuss plans and explore strategies to confront corruption in their provinces.

IF held a number of meetings, workshops and trainings. IMGs met in four interprovincial meetings, one training of trainers (TOT) workshop in Baghdad on the National Anti-Corruption Strategy, and one 4-day national meeting held in Erbil during which IMG members in attendance were trained on networking skills and using the IF-created PAG website. Additionally, IF trained 120 civic leaders from 15 provinces on the methodology and use of Global Integrity (GI) indicators at the Beirut ToT. 48 high level leaders attended these meetings. Senior government officials, provincial council members, civic leaders, and CSOs from all 15 provinces were in attendance.

IF engaged youth to combat corruption through offering website training, holding educational workshops and empowering students to run public awareness campaigns on anti-corruption. 375 students participated in over 30 local projects in 15 provinces.

IF held a press conference on the final Agenda for Change report attended by over 200 persons. IF produced good governance indicators in Arabic for the IMGs. IF distributed 15,000 posters and 25,000 pamphlets on the Code of Conduct and related compliance laws and 210 copies out of 2000 printed copies of the final national Agenda for Change Report. IF broadcasted 229 monthly radio talk shows and 315 30-second television spots on national, Al-Iraqiya TV, to raise awareness of corruption issues.

PAG had three objectives:

- Increase capacity to implement Iraqi anti-corruption measures at the provincial level
- Promote government accountability and transparency and strengthen civic capacity to conduct oversight in the provinces
- Conduct oversight and improve accountability and transparency.

In October 2011, IF requested a no-cost extension of six months to complete planned activities and to incorporate new activities to promote awareness of the NAS and bolster civic activism among Iraqi youth.
The project achieved its stated objectives, implementing more activities than previously planned for, and responding to emerging conditions that required careful attention.

**OBJECTIVE 1: INCREASE CAPACITY TO IMPLEMENT IRAQI ANTI-CORRUPTION MEASURES AT THE PROVINCIAL LEVEL**

*Civic Leaders Workshops*
During the course of the project, IF trained 450 civic leaders from 15 provinces on Iraq's anti-corruption legal and regulatory framework in Iraq in order to combat corruption in their communities. 96 high level civic leaders attended these workshops.

- **Overview:** From March 19-April 23, 2010 two-day workshops for civic leaders were held in all 15 provinces. These workshops were delivered to CSOs, business professionals, law groups, journalists, academics, clerics, and members of the Commission on Integrity (COI) as well as other stakeholders and opinion shapers in the provinces. 30 participants representing all 15 provinces attended each workshop in addition to IF staff members and two trainers. All participants received training material on a CD as well as a pocket-sized pamphlet of the Code of Conduct and Iraqi compliance laws. Workshops were well-covered by members of the local media.

- **Topics:** Workshops discussed the PAG project in the context of anti-corruption. This concept of corruption was introduced in terms of its varieties and causes as well as the role of civil society in fighting and preventing corruption. The new NAS of Iraq, Iraqi procurement laws and regulations and relevant articles of the Iraqi Penal Code were introduced as well as the UN anti-corruption convention. Access to Information laws in other countries were highlighted as means to ensure transparency of government information and a type of accountability. Participants were briefed on the structure and mission of the COI. They discussed obstacles hindering the work of national bodies, such as the COI, in combating corruption locally in order to formulate recommendations on ways in which civic groups can support the COI's mission.

- **Results:** Participants formulated recommendations on ways in which civic groups can bolster the efforts of governmental bodies, such as the COI. One participant (Baghdad) described the absence of an effective anti-corruption law, a transparency law, and the right to access information law as basic obstacles hindering the effectiveness of the COI. Additional recommendations were recorded on a questionnaire form distributed to workshop participants following its conclusion.
As the result of the workshops, leading civic groups in the provinces have greater knowledge of the anti-corruption legal and regulatory framework and are better equipped to assist the COI. Finally, civic leaders can use their knowledge for advocacy, leadership in their professions, and for educating others in the community about transparent, local and government practices.

**Provincial Leaders Workshops**

COI experts delivered the training to 450 provincial council members and other senior officials in the provinces on the Code of Conduct (CoC) and the associated Law on Compliance and Disciplinary Action in all 15 provinces. 276 high level officials attended these meetings.

- **Overview:** From March 18-April 28, 2010, IF conducted a series of one-day workshops for senior provincial officials, including members of the provincial council, in all 15 provinces. About 30 participants attended each workshop in addition to IF PAG staff and two trainers per workshop. All participants received a pocket-sized pamphlet of the COC and the compliance laws. Additionally, training materials were put on a CD and distributed.

- **Topics:** The workshops introduced PAG and clarified the objectives of the training. Trainers defined corruption and discussed the concept of ethics within government as well as the CoC and compliance laws. Particular emphasis was placed in the collaboration between the anti-corruption committees of the provincial council and the COI. Trainers reviewed the UN convention for anti-corruption as well as the major government authorities and structure of local government and breadth of their duties in combating corruption.

- **Results:** These workshops served to promote the code of conduct for public services and educate members of the provincial councils as well as other officials, such as members of the anti-corruption committee, general inspector office and the Governors’ office, on the importance of the COC and related compliance law. These officials are now able to oversee compliance by employees and can enforce compliance through disciplinary action when necessary. Additionally, a set of recommendations emerged from these meetings, some of which specifically deal with ways in which civic groups can assist the COI. Recommendations mentioned the following needs: stronger enforcement of existing compliance laws, transparency of government work, capacity building trainings for government leaders, whistle blower protection, and giving more attention to reports presented by watch dog groups, the COI and CSOs.
Dissemination of Code of Conduct and Compliance Law

Between April – June 2010 and January – February 2012, IF distributed 15,000 posters and 25,000 pamphlets on the CoC and related Compliance Law.

- **Overview:** To promote the COC, IF designed, printed, and distributed 10,000 posters of the full text of the COC. These posters were distributed to CSOs, educational establishments, government institutions (courts, police stations, government hospitals), mosques, tea shops, supermarkets, youth venues, industrial and trade unions, bar associations, and media headquarters where they can be readily seen by the public. IF disseminated 1,000 posters to each of the 15 provinces and coordinated the distribution process of the posters with the COI. The posters are now displayed in the streets in addition to public and private premises in 15 Iraqi provinces.

- **Results:** A total of 20,000 pamphlets on the COC and compliance laws were disseminated in all 15 provinces: IF designed and printed 18,000 and the COI provided IF with 2,000 pamphlets, which were distributed during PAG workshops. The remaining 5,000 pamphlets were distributed in early 2012 as part of the no-cost extension activities. The Commission on Integrity contributed to the production of these pamphlets. Approximately 1,667 pamphlets were disseminated in each province. The pamphlets were distributed to educational establishments, especially universities, and the offices of government officials and professional groups, including chambers of commerce, law associations, journalists’ associations, CSOs, and PAG workshops (both civic and provincial leaders).

15,000 posters were distributed to CSOs, educational establishments, professional associations, government institutions and other community locations, such as mosques, tea shops, supermarkets and youth venues.

- In Diyala, Ms. Iman Abdul Wahab, a provincial council member, participated in the distribution of pamphlets and even visited the provincial governor’s office to distribute pamphlets to his staff. In one province in early 2012, IMG members requested additional pamphlets to distribute among town hall meeting participants to inform the discussion!
As a result of IF’s advocacy, provincial government officials are now more aware of and sensitized to the COC and compliance rule and citizens are motivated to promote transparency and fight corruption.

OBJECTIVE 2: PROMOTE GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY AND STRENGTHEN CIVIC CAPACITY TO CONDUCT OVERSIGHT IN THE PROVINCES

Training of Trainer (ToT) workshops

IF trained 120 civic leaders from 15 provinces on the methodology and use of Global Integrity (GI) indicators. 48 high level leaders attended these meetings.

- **Overview:** On May 25-June 9, 2010, IF, in collaboration with the Lebanese Transparency Association (LTA), conducted four four-day back-to-back TOT workshops at the Radisson BLU Martinez Hotel Beirut, Lebanon on the methodologies and indicators for monitoring good governance. Senior government officials, provincial council members, civic leaders, and CSOs from all 15 provinces were in attendance. The workshops were all widely covered by the media.

- **Topics:** Training topics focused on the explanation of anti-corruption indicators in assessing accountability and transparency, existing opportunities for engagement and reform, and lessons learned from Lebanese, Egyptian, and Jordanian government monitoring efforts. At the end of each TOT workshop, IF and LTA divided the participants into groups according to province and facilitated a dialogue among group participants to identify indicators of progress on anti-corruption, accountability, and transparency that best fit their local context (see Developing an Agenda for Change).

- **Attendees:** The participants of the four workshops were selected by IF from among the participants of the 15 workshops held for civic and provincial leaders in each of the provinces. IF’s Executive Director, Ms. Rend Al-Rahim, IF’s Chief Operator Officer, Ms. Selwa Gailani, PAG’s Iraq Project Manager, Ms. Al-Asadi, and PAG staff attended the workshops. The training was led by LTA’s Managing Director, Mr. Yahya Hakim. IF received several letters of appreciation from the participants for the training.

- **Results:** Once the Agendas were finalized by LTA and approved by IF, they were adopted by the Integrity Monitoring Groups (IMGs), citizens’
groups tasked with the adoption of and advocating for the Agendas for Change written at these meetings in each province. Additionally, LTA’s GI indicators were translated into Arabic by IF and made available during the conference. As a result of these trainings, Iraqi CSOs are better equipped to monitor, analyze, and report on government accountability. Additionally, participants know how to use practical indicators in the assessment of transparency and accountability. IF harnessed and encouraged provincial cooperation between civic leaders and government officials for the combating of corruption in the writing of the Agendas for Change.

**Formation of Integrity Monitoring Groups; Publication of the Agenda for Change**

Approved Agendas for Change: [http://www.iraqfoundation.org/projects_new/pag/Agendas%20For%20Change-Approved.html](http://www.iraqfoundation.org/projects_new/pag/Agendas%20For%20Change-Approved.html)


From July – September 2010, IF facilitated the formation of 15 IMGs, which adopted and advocated for the Agendas for Change at the provincial level. Throughout the remainder of the project, IF facilitated monthly meetings for consultation on strategies, activities, and work plans.

- **Formation of IMGs:** In consultation with IF’s local CSO partners and civic leaders who were in attendance at the TOT trainings in Lebanon, IF facilitated the formation of IMGs to adopt and advocate for the Agendas for Change written at these meetings in each province.

- **Publication of Agenda for Change:** During staff visits to the provinces, IF discussed with the newly formed IMGs the draft Agenda for Change, made several changes, and adopted a timeline. After receiving the approval of the GOR, Mr. Anthony Eterno, on September 23, 2010, IF began working immediately for the implementation of the Agendas for Change according to the time-table of each Province. Agendas for Change were published in the local press and members of the IMGs participated in TV and radio interviews to inform the public.

- **Results:** As the results of IF’s efforts, 15 IMGs were formed in all provinces to engage in monitoring anti-corruption and transparency indicators and to establish cooperation with other civic groups, the media and local government. Additionally, the Agendas for Change were adopted in all 15 provinces as the work-plan of the IMGs. Agendas served as a measure of progress on anti-corruption, transparency and good governance. Agendas were published in the local media and radio and TV spots were utilized to highlight the work of the IMGs.
• As the result of the adoption of the Agendas for Change by the IMGs, the cooperation between provincial governments and civic leaders greatly increased. In several provinces, the provincial government asked members of the IMGs to advise particular committees and in some cases, even formed a special anti-corruption committee, in Ninawa for example. IMGs were also invited to monitor governmental staff election processes.

• Al-Qadisiyah established a Facebook page for the reporting and publishing of cases. The IMG in Wasit established an Anti-Corruption Monitoring Center to track, monitor, and report corruption in the province and also established an email address to receive reports of corruption. IMGs have contributed to the resolution of (45) corruption cases in Iraq. Based on collaboration between the IMGs and government officials, (18) officials have been investigated and disciplined.

• (31) government officials requested to join the IMGs, while (20) PC resolutions have been issued by the PC.

**IMG Monthly Consultation Meetings**

IF staff coordinated a number of monthly consultation meetings for members of the IMGs to assess activities and lessons learned, plan for forthcoming activities, and foster a sense of cohesion and purpose.

• **Overview:** IF coordinated 10-13 internal monthly meetings for members of the IMGs beginning in August 2010 and continuing throughout the remainder of the project for a total of over 100 meetings. As part of the no-cost extension activities, 74 additional meetings were held.
• **Topics:** In these meetings, members of the IMGs in the provinces reviewed the implementation progress of the provincial Agenda for Change and the progress of anti-corruption work in the province. Work strategies, coordination, and collaboration with stakeholders were also discussed and planned. Each group planned its periodic visits to the local government officials, prepared, and designed appropriate questions for radio talk show interviews. Cooperation and coordination between the IMGs, NGO partners and IF were a constant topic of discussion.

• **Results:** Throughout the course of these meetings, 641 IMG members and local stakeholders reviewed the agenda for change periodically to assess progress.

**National Anti-Corruption Strategy (NAS) Training of Trainers (ToT) Workshop**

On November 30 and December 1, 2011, in cooperation with COI, IF facilitated a two-day training of trainers (TOT) workshop in Baghdad on the National Anti-Corruption Strategy (NAS).

- The training brought together two IMG members from each province as well as IF PAG staff. The training focused on the strategy and specific roles of government agencies, NGOs, media, and the general public in implementing the NAS.
- The first day of the training took place in the COI building. Mr. Mohamed Al-Masoudi, a COI expert, conducted the training. He explained the concept of the strategy, its objectives and steps to its implementation. He clarified that in 2005 and 2006, Iraq was listed as one of the most corrupt countries but in recent years, rates have dropped. The first day of training focused on:
  - General concept of NAS
  - Specific terminology pertinent to NAS
  - Strengths and weaknesses of the strategy
  - Steps to implement NAS
  - Legal framework of NAS
  - Laws needed to supplement and strengthen the strategy

  By the end of the training day, the participants were asked for their input and suggestions on the NAS.

- The second day of training took place the COI office in Al-Risafa district. Dr. Khalid Al-Mamouri, Chief of NAS Specialists, delivered the training by retrieving and supplementing the topics of the previous day with more
information and examples. He explained the difficulties faced by UN experts when structuring and shaping the NAS. Then he explained the role of the NGOs, general public, media and government in implementing the NAS. Dr. Al-Mamouri discussed and addressed the concerns of participants who formulated the following recommendations:

- Establish an E-Government Program
- Create a TV channel for the COI
- Separate the Inspector General offices from their relevant ministries and make them independent
- Include the Kurdistan region in the implementation of the NAS.
- Enact all necessary laws to support and strengthen the NAS.
- Ratify the NAS via an exclusive law.
- Work with IF to make some necessary changes on some points of the strategy.

- Training was delivered by experts from the Commission of Integrity (COI).

**Educational Workshop for Iraqi Youth**


During the month of December 2011, IF coordinated 30 educational workshops for Iraqi youth in 15 provinces. Following the workshops, 375 students participated in public awareness event throughout Iraq.

- **Overview:** The workshops were delivered to university and high school students between the ages of 15-19 and sought to engage youth to fight corruption. The workshops demonstrated to youth how to foster civic values to promote transparency, good governance and ways to curb corruption.

- **Topics:** Trainers briefed youth on the activities of the PAG project and the work of the IMGs. IMG members spoke on Iraq’s NAS, the COC, and the Agendas for Change as well as relevant information from the UN Convention against Corruption. IMGs explained the role of youth in anti-corruption efforts and in terms of Iraq’s NAS as follows:
  - Understand Iraq’s NAS, believe in it’s importance and advocate for its implementation
  - Explain the strategy to friends and community
  - Enlighten others about the objectives of the strategy
  - Monitor the strategy’s implementation
  - Enrich their communities by upholding the values of Iraqi citizenship
IF and the IMGs also introduced the PAG website to trainees and encouraged them to use it to monitor and report corruption. IF asked students to brainstorm methods to confront corruption in their province. Among the recommendations from one of the workshops, in Thi-Qar are the following:

- Holding a cartoon exhibit to show the effect of corruption
- Conducting plays about corruption and unfairness in particular sectors or in the selection process for government positions
- Facilitating a town hall meeting similar to the town hall meetings IF conducted
- Printing 1,000 anti-corruption posters and distributing them to all the government agencies in the province and mount them on the main streets of the provinces

At the end of each educational workshop, IF thanked all attendees and promised to continue working with them in the battle against corruption.

**Results:** Each workshop targeted 50 students. 100 students were trained in each province for a total of 1,500 students.

### Youth Activities


IF worked with local anti-corruption citizens’ groups, Integrity Monitoring Groups (IMGs), to coordinate over 30 extremely successful youth-led activities in 15 provinces. Detailed information on selected students’ projects by province is described below:

- **Al-Muthanna**
  - On January 30, students performed a play, which was attended by over 120 students in addition to a number of university professors. The play discussed incidences of corruption that commonly occur in Iraq and the consequences facing society as a result of such corruption.
  - On January 30, students presented 45 caricatures at an exhibit, attended by over 100 students.

- **Anbar**
  - On February 23, 2012, students opened a playground at a local girls’ school. This activity was a supplemental activity to the art exhibit activity of the same school on January 30, 2012.
  - On January 30, 2012, students held an art exhibit displaying 65 works of art. This event was well covered by members of the media.

- **Baghdad**
On January 30, 2012, IF assisted students in presenting a puppet show at Imam Sadiq University entitled, “No to Corruption… Yes to Transparency.”

On January 31, 2012, IF cooperated with local youth to organize a soccer game after which medals and gold trophies were distributed to the winning team. The losing team received silver trophies. Their jerseys displayed the slogan, “No to Corruption… Yes to Transparency.”

On April 9, 2012, as part of IF’s second no-cost extension activities, IF coordinated a youth soccer game at a local playground. Youth wore T-shirts displaying the phrase, “No to Corruption… Yes to Transparency.”

Babil

On January 25-27, IF supported local youth in holding a 2-day forum for youth titled, “Forum for Combating Administrative and Financial Corruption” at the University of Babil. 120 individuals, including students, professors and other members of the community, attended the forum. During this period, university youth also distributed 1500 copies of critical anti-corruption information around campus.

On January 29-30, 2012, youth worked with the Department of Physical Education at the University of Babil to organize two races to promote the culture of combating corruption.

Basra

On February 4, youth held a poetry festival to raise awareness of corruption issues.

On February 9-10, a group of students held a two-day mobile exhibition. On the first day, students visited the University of Basra and to the offices of a number of government officials including, the Minister of Human Rights, the Head of the County and members of the Provincial Council and a number of professors and students. On the second day, students spoke with a number of citizens and visited the offices of a number of local government officials to distribute pamphlets and posters on the CoC as well as the telephone numbers of the Commission on Integrity’s hotlines. Youth also conducted interviews throughout the exhibition.

Diwaniya

Throughout the month of February, the Diwaniya IMG worked with local youth to hold a radio program and launch PSAs on the radio to raise awareness of corruption.

On February 27, 2012, the local IMG held a special form for youth to familiarize them with the National Anti-Corruption Strategy (NAS)
and the role of CSOs, the local IMG and the Iraq Foundation in this strategy. Youth were also briefed on the many manifestations of corruption and ways to combat it.

- **Diyala**
  - From January 15-31, 2012, two groups of students worked to raise awareness of corruption issues in the community: One group traveled to local elementary, middle and high schools in the area to educate young students on corruption and another worked in rural and urban areas to raise awareness among all community members.

- **Karbala**
  - Students held a play entitled, “When the Papers are Mixed” on January 25-27. Approximately 56 people attended performances.
  - From January 25 – 31, 2012, students held an art exhibit featuring 110 pictures, 4 large posters and 50 booklets. The exhibit was titled, “No to Corruption… Yes to Integrity.”

- **Kirkuk**
  - On January 17, 2012, IF assisted students in organizing a free verse poetry festival to combat corruption at a local elementary school.
  - On January 19, 2012, IF assisted students to organize a cartoon exhibition. The exhibition was attended by students and members of the community of both genders. 16 pieces were on display.

- **Maysan**
  - On January 15, 2012, students organized an exhibit featuring 65 illustrations and photographs highlighting the effects of corruption on society. Attendees enjoyed the artwork and recommended that students hold these exhibitions in local schools in order to expand the awareness raising efforts. Students also held a short symposium to introduce the achievements of the project.
  - On February 25, 2012, students held a skit to raise awareness.

- **Najaf**
  - On January 17 and 19, the local IMG facilitated two youth workshops that included artistic exhibitions: a skit and an exhibition of cartoons on corruption.

- **Ninewa**
  - From January 31 to February 6, 2012, local youth painted anti-corruption murals in 32 schools. In the mural pictured below, a tortoise is fatigued by the burdens of society (unemployment, basic services, vulnerable populations) while a rabbit runs ahead, unhampered as he carries only “corruption.”
On February 27, 2012, students held an art exhibit depicting the effects of corruption on society. A number of government officials and representatives of local CSOs were in attendance.

In April, 2012 as part of PAG’s no-cost extension, a group of students released a large hot-air balloon with the slogan, “Yes to Transparency, No to Corruption” displayed. Students also marched with signs denouncing corruption.

- Salah Al-Deen
  - In February, 2012, youth held an art exhibit to combat corruption and facilitated a discussion forum between youth and local government on corruption.

- Thi Qar
  - On January 26, students completed shooting an anti-corruption film and delivered a copy to the head of the local IMG. From January 20-27, 2012, students discussed with their local IMG the idea of establishing an electronic bulletin on corruption issues to support the project.
  - From January 20-27, 2012, students discussed with their local IMG the idea of establishing an electronic bulletin on corruption issues to support the project. On February 24, an electronic publication created by youth was completed.
  - On April 10, as part of IF’s second no-cost extension activities, a group of youth and the head of the Thi Qar IMG met with a local television network to discuss broadcasting PSAs to combat corruption. The PSA was aired eight times during the period from 4/15-4/22 and depicted the destruction of recently constructed sidewalks.

- Wasit (2)
  - On January 24, 2012, local youth worked with the Wasit IMG to hold a five-kilometer marathon to bolster community support for anti-corruption efforts sponsored by IF. More than 50 young men and women ran in the marathon. Runners wore special shirts with the message: “No to corruption, yes to transparency.” The event was unexpectedly successful and resulted in the formation of a youth group that calls themselves, “Friends of the IMG” and has expressed eagerness to work with the local IMG on future projects. As a result of their efforts, students were awarded honorary medals by the Head of the county.
  - On April 2-5, the Wasit IMG worked with local youth to create a mural depicting the negative consequences of corruption on society.
OBJECTIVE 3: CONDUCT OVERSIGHT AND IMPROVE ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY.

Quarterly Town Hall Meetings

IF held 90 quarterly town hall meetings for the oversight groups and provincial officials to review the Agenda for Change, track progress on the indicators and note improvements or difficulties in agenda implementation. 1075 attendees contributed to these town hall meetings throughout the 15 provinces.

• Overview: Beginning in October 2010 and continuing throughout the remainder of the project, IF facilitated 6 town hall meetings per province throughout the life of the project, including the no-cost extension, for a total of 90 meetings. Town hall meetings were difficult to coordinate in certain provinces due to security concerns.

• Topics/Attendees: Local officials, the media, and the general public attended these meetings in which the IMGs presented interim reports on the status of the Agenda for Change in their provinces and invited government officials to discuss the findings and recommendations addressed by the IMGs and the general public. At these meetings, the general public was able to interact face-to-face with the government officials of their provinces, who addressed the people’s inquiries and described anti-corruption efforts and procedures adopted at the local level. Individuals from the community were able to discuss incidents of corruption they had experienced personally. About 70-150 members of the community attended each meeting.

• Results: As the result of the town hall meetings conducted in each province, the public and the media have direct access to officials and in
turn, officials realize the importance of communication with the public and the press. In some provinces, officials requested that the IMGs arrange additional town hall meetings. Additionally, the town hall meetings contributed to increased transparency in government activities, higher public expectations of government accountability and greater community buy-in in oversight activities. Following town hall meetings, government officials and members of the community became more involved in local initiatives to combat corruption. In Babil, officials encouraged citizens to make sure to have proof of any incidences of corruption as many complaints lack evidence. In Thi-Qar province, 1250 community members signed a petition advocating for the passing of the Access to Information bill. Additionally, many IMGs reported increased reporting of incidences of corruption by the general public. Recommendations offered by participants include: implementation of timelines locally to ensure completion of anti-corruption projects by local government; more town hall meetings between NGOs, IMGs, anti-corruption bodies and the general public; more freedom to local NGOs to exercise monitoring; increased visits of the government anti-corruption bodies and IMGs to ongoing government funded projects in province to investigate possible incidences of corruption.

Radio Talk Shows
Schedule updated to February 2012:
Photos: July 4, 2011, Samawa (Al-Muthanna):
Photos: June 2011, Samawa (Al-Muthanna):
Photos: August – November 2010:

With the objective of broadening public awareness and knowledge of the policies and practices of government and expanding understanding of anti-corruption and accountability issues, IMGs hosted 230 radio talk shows in each province with government officials. These interviews touched on the Agenda for Change, measures taken by the provincial government to combat corruption and improve transparency and acquaint the public with the work of the IMGs.

• Interviews: From August 2010-December 2011, IF facilitated 155 talk shows/interviews (planned for 180) in which IMG members interviewed a local government official and discussed anti-corruption measures being adopted. During the additional quarters granted by the no-cost extension, IF conducted 74 additional interviews for a total of 229 interviews. Interview questions were prepared by the IMGs in monthly consultation meetings and approved by IF. Examples of interview questions include:
What steps did your committee pursue to combat corruption in the provincial education system?

What is corruption and what are its causes in your opinion?

How do you view corruption in the health and environmental institutions of the province?

Who opens the recently installed complaint boxes? Who looks into these complaints?

What are the most significant corruption cases that have been identified by the Provincial Council?

Where can one report an experience of exploitation by a public official?

What do you think of the anti-corruption project (PAG) that is being implemented in your province?

**Results:** As a result of these interviews, the number, frequency and type of communication by government officials with citizens was increased, the public had greater access to officials and officials accepted the need to communicate better with the public. Additionally, radio shows contributed to greater transparency in government activities and higher public expectations of transparency.

**TV Programming**

Beginning in October of 2010 and continuing throughout the course of the program, IF produced and broadcasted 315 (105 over 3 quarters) 30-second image-based anti-corruption messages in order to sensitize the Iraqi public to the negative consequences of corruption on their welfare and on democracy and to motivate the public to demand good governance through putting public officials under greater public pressure. IF was able to produce more than the originally planned 250 TV spots as the result of the generosity of many organizations that donated airtime free of charge.

**Overview:** IF managed to produce and broadcast PAG’s anti-corruption TV spots in coordination with the media company in Dubai, BPG. The TV spots were launched December 8, 2010 and continued until September 2011. Programming was broadcasted on Al-Iraqia. TV. The programs show the impact of corruption on the health services, employment, education, and the infrastructure of Iraq. The TV spots were deployed in bursts to ensure regular frequency. The prime time of their deployment was 1900-2200 hours.

**Survey:** In March 2011, IF designed and distributed a survey form in 15 provinces to measure the impact of PAG TV spots in the provinces. The
form was distributed to people of different backgrounds, educational level and gender. About 300 respondents contributed to the survey. Demographic questions covered gender, age group, level of education, and regions covered by the survey. According to survey results, participants indicated that a majority of respondents had watched the anti-corruption TV spots 1-10 times per month and believed them to be effective in augmenting the public’s understanding of means to fight corruption. Furthermore, respondents indicated that they believed the general public and government officials to be impacted by the TV spots.

**Coalition-Building Meetings**


Throughout the project, IF facilitated four regional meetings of IMGs to exchange information about their activities, discuss successes and challenges, identify best practices and coordinate their approaches to officials, the media and the public.

- **Overview:** During the months of February and March 2011, IF facilitated the implementation of four two-day regional coalition building meetings across Iraq: in the north-west, in the Baghdad region, in the mid-south, and in the southern region. About 30 participants attended each meeting including, IMGs in the region and PAG staff as well as other anti-corruption stakeholders.

- **North-West Meeting:** On February 20-21, IF facilitated the first regional coalition building meeting between IMGs in the north-west region. IMGs from Salah Al-Din, Kirkuk and Ninawa met to discuss activities, successes and challenges, identify best practices and coordinate their outreach efforts. Recommendations include: conducting additional town hall meetings in the province; preparing a directory of anti-corruption projects annually; conducting additional anti-corruption and COC workshops to government staff; replacing the procurement committees of certain departments every six months to one year. Ms. Suhaila Al-Assadi and Amna Al-Katib (PAG IF Staff) attended this meeting.

- **Baghdad-area Meeting:** On February 23-24, 2011, IF brought together IMGs of the Baghdad region including those from Baghdad, Anbar, Babil, and Diyala provinces. Recommendations delivered during the meeting include: establishing a special committee to monitor and open the complaint boxes of Baghdad Provincial Council and to advocate among the general public for the reporting of incidences of corruption to the IMGs. Ms. Suhaila Al-Assadi and Amna Al-Katib (PAG IF Staff) attended this meeting.
• **Mid-South Meeting:** On February 27-28, 2011, IF facilitated the mid-south regional coalition building meeting between the IMGs of Karbala, Najaf, Al-Muthanna, and Wasit. Ms. Suhaila Al-Assadi, PAG Project Manager, and Ms. Amina Mohammed, PAG Project Assistant, were also in attendance. Ms. Al-Assadi welcomed participants and described the purpose of the meeting. In turn, each IMG presented its work, achievements and obstacles faced in the implementation of its work. Each IMG offered implementation updates of their Agendas for Change. All groups described outreach activities with reference to the media, anti-corruption entities, government officials and the general public in their provinces. Success stories were exchanged among IMGs. Additionally, IMGs described specific incidences of corruption and steps taken to address these issues. The Karbala IMG reported that the public is reporting corruption to the IMG before the government.

• **South Meeting:** On March 29-30, 2011, IF facilitated the south regional coalition building meeting between the IMGs of Basra, Maysan, and Thi-Qar. This meeting was re-scheduled due to widespread protests in Basra during February of 2011. IMGs exchanged success stories, challenges, and recommendations for implementation of Agendas for Change. Recommendations that emerged from this meeting include: Intensifying pressure on all government facilities to install more complaint boxes and activate existing boxes; Advocate for NGOs to join committees governing complaint boxes in each province; Enact a whistle-blower protection law. Ms. Suhaila Al-Assadi and Amna Al-Katib (PAG IF Staff) attended this meeting.

**Building a Networking Site**

IF established and continues to manage a networking website to allow for the exchange of information on activities of IMGs and anti-corruption developments in provincial government for members of IMGs as well as the wider public.

• In the reporting period of July-September, 2011, IF launched the PAG website, which serves as a resource for IMGs to exchange information on activities including meetings with government officials, successes and challenges and progress on the Agendas for Change. In this way, the website strengthens the sense of community among the groups working on anti-corruption through email communication tools. Additionally, the website gathers and posts data from the provinces on regulations, budgets, expenditures, contracts and procurement practices. Finally, the website serves as a resource for public access to information and resources relating to combating corruption and increasing transparency.
Training on website usage was held during the National IMG meeting in Erbil on November 2-5, 2011 according to the activities approved in the no-cost extension (National IMG Meeting).

**IMG Visits to the Provincial Council**


Throughout the project, IF has organized monthly visits of the IMGs to provincial government officials.

**Overview**: Beginning in October 2010 and continuing throughout the course of the project, IF organized 168 meetings between IMGs and provincial government officials. During the two quarters granted under the no-cost extension, IF arranged 74 visits for a total of 242 visits.

**Topics**: During these meetings, attendees discussed plans and explored strategies to confront corruption in their provinces. Cooperation and strategies to monitor government performance in light of international indicators were studied and discussed. Attendees discussed methods to change attitudes regarding corruption. In an August visit of the Thi-Qar IMG to the PC, attendees suggested religious education as a means to change the attitudes of community members and engage them as advocates of anti-corruption.

**Results**: As the result of the collaborative efforts of IMGs and local provincial councils, several provinces established anti-corruption committees for the council and/or requested IMG members to advise particular councils. Additionally, many provincial council members requested to join and/or joined the IMGs. IMGs worked closely with the provincial councils to deliver any complaints of corruption to the appropriate officials.

**IMG members worked closely with government officials on several bills, laws, and regulations (provincial level) including:**
- Passing the Whistle Blower Bill: Ninawa
- Passing the Bill of the Right to Access Information: Ninawa
- Repealing Article 136(b), which allowed Iraqi ministers to stop interrogation procedures against accused employees in their ministries
- Regulation to open complaint boxes: Baghdad
- Regulation to declare the financial and property assets of Municipal council members: Baghdad
- Regulation to open investigations with some municipal council members: Baghdad
- Resolution to activate Media Commission Act in the province: Babil
- Regulation abolishing the financial benefits of the PC post: Babil
- Regulation to produce a directory of all the province’s construction projects and budgets: Ninawa
- Regulation to permit all journalist and media people to cover any event in the province: Ninawa

**National IMG Meeting in Erbil**


As part of the no-cost extension activities, IF facilitated a national meeting in Erbil for IMGs created as part of PAG’s project activities.

- **Overview:** On November 2-5, 2011, IF held a four-day national meeting in Erbil for all IMGs. The purpose of the meeting was two-fold: first, IF trained the IMGs on using the PAG website to monitor and report progress of anti-corruption activities and second, IF aimed to provide a forum for IMGs to present interim reports to identify opportunities, share lessons learned while implementing the Agenda for Change, quantify and evaluate progress, identify common obstacles and identify “priority areas” to carry out advocacy and recommendations for the future. During this meeting, IF formed a unified National Agenda for change. Additionally, IF encouraged the IMGs to form a formal network to sustain their presence beyond the project period. IMGs also received guidance on structuring final reports. Elected National IMG

- **Training:** One of the purposes of this gathering was to train IMGs to use the PAG website to monitor and report incidences of corruption in their provinces. IF also trained the IMGs on networking. Members of IMGs were present from all 15 provinces. Government officials, officials from the COI and IF staff attended the meeting. In total, 90 individuals were in attendance. On Day 1, the IMGs were divided into four groups according to their provinces to receive training on the website and on networking.
Website: Mr. Ali Zayni, the website trainer, discussed the website, necessary steps to utilize its different features, and how to view and post corruption news. A committee of 15 IMG members, one from each province, was selected to administer the provinces’ pages on the website. Trainees practiced accessing the site, posting a report, and communication.

Networking: Network training was carried out by Mr. Abdul Salam Al-Madani. He described the structure elements and steps of formulating a network as well as the advantages of establishing a network. Mr. Al-Madani allowed participants to decide the appropriate structure for their network. On the evening of the first training day, IMG members elected a president, Ms. Ibtisam Al-Shimari, and board of directors for the network. The network is called “the National Network for Transparency and Monitoring of Corruption (NNTMC)” and is now undergoing final registration stages with the Iraqi Council of Ministers.

On Day 2 of the meeting, trainees were divided into four sub-groups to introduce and discuss their to-date province reports and Agendas for change. With the help of a facilitator, main points and success stories were combined into one group report.

On Day 3 of the meeting, the four groups continued to present their province reports and Agendas for Change. Ms. Rend Al-Rahim, IF’s Executive Director, and Suhaila Al-Asadi, PAG Project Manager, delivered the training on the structure of the final report required from each IMG at the end of the project. Ms. Rend Al-Rahim was awarded a shield from the participants for her efforts. A joint committee was tasked with establishing a unified National Agenda for Change and final report.

On Day 4 of the meeting, a template of the final report was decided and later distributed to all the participants to adopt for their final report. Ms. Al-Rahim thanked all participants for their hard work in fighting corruption and wished them success in their future endeavors.

Final Report, Press Conference
On April 26, IF held a press conference for the release of the final PAG report.
Over 200 persons were in attendance, including major media outlets.

- The conference began at 10 AM with a brief introduction by Ms. Suhaila Al-Assadi, PAG Program Manager. Ms. Al-Assadi discussed the significant cooperation of government institutions with the Iraq Foundation as a key component of the 3-year program. She specifically offered thanks to the Commission on Integrity and their assistance in developing a training curriculum, providing trainings to IMG members on the National Anti-Corruption Strategy and attending key program activities. She also thanked participating organizations and members of the 15 IMGs in each province for their work implementing the project’s agenda. Ms. Al-Assadi also expressed the enthusiasm of the Iraq Foundation with regards to the participation of youth in the project’s activities. Finally, she thanked all that have contributed to the success of the project, including any individuals who assisted in translation, and offered her congratulations to Ms. Rend Al-Rahim, Ms. Selwa Gailani and all IF staff on the success of the project.

- Following Ms. Al-Assadi’s introduction, Dr. Salah Abd Razzak, Baghdad governor, discussed the achievements of IF through the course of the project. He reported that corruption in Iraq has declined over the past three years. He highlighted three key aspects to encouraging transparency: legislation to limit the incidence of corruption, institutionalized procedures to limit corrupt practices, such as bribery, and monitoring efforts.

- Mr. Sijad Ma’touq, Head of the Department of NGOs, expressed the enthusiasm of his department to cooperate with the IMGs and IF on implementing this project. He expressed his gratitude and appreciation to IF for establishing this project and the IMGs that carried out the project and worked to monitor corruption.

- Mr. Ali Dawoud Al A’tar, Head of the Office for Reconstruction and Development of the Baghdad Provincial Council, spoke briefly on the council’s cooperation with the IMGs and the Iraq Foundation

- IF staff then presented awards to a number of officials representative of bodies, which proved instrumental in the implementation of the project. This included the Office of the Governor of Baghdad, the Baghdad Provincial Council, the Commission on Integrity, the Department of NGOs, among others. IF also presented letters of appreciation to the heads of participating organizations.
• Members of a number of IMGs then spoke about the nature of their work as part of PAG, how they built up partnerships with the provincial councils, the Commission on Integrity, the media, and the community.

• Each speaker thanked the Iraq Foundation and in particular, Ms. Rend Al-Rahim and the project staff, for the program which served to effect real change in the provinces through creating an atmosphere of transparency and bringing together citizens and local government. Participants also urged IF to continue using the approach of this program, namely bringing together civil society organizations and local government in order to effect real change in the provinces.

OTHER ACTIVITIES

Anti-Corruption Workshop, Baghdad
http://www.iraqfoundation.org/projects_new/pag/CPI-CodeofConductWSDec09.htm

• Overview: On December 24, 2009, the Iraqi Commission on Integrity (COI) in collaboration with the Iraq Foundation held an anti-corruption workshop in the Baghdad governorate building.

• Topics/Attendees: The workshop covered IF’s work with the COI in combating corruption in Iraq, the CoC and associated compliance laws and the application of these laws within government institutions in Iraq. Training was delivered by a PhD professor and lawyer from the COI. The Baghdad Governor, Baghdad governorate council members, senior officials, and general inspectors from the Baghdad governorate council attended the workshop in addition to representatives of local CSOs. In total, 128 individuals attended the workshop.

• Results: Participants offered a number of recommendations following the conclusion of the meeting, including the following:
  o All governorate officials under the authority of Baghdad’s governate council should abide to the COC of the COI.
  o The Baghdad Governor, in association with the COI and IF, should structure a new strategy for fighting corruption within Baghdad’s Governorate Council.
  o The institutions of Baghdad’s governorate council must be subject to performance evaluations carried out by the relevant authorities and local CSOs.
  o Training workshops should be held for Baghdad’s governorate council officials on the COC under the supervision of the Baghdad
Governorate Council’s Committee for Anticorruption and the Office of Civil Society Organization at the COI in cooperation with Baghdad and Al-Mustansiriya Universities.

- The Baghdad Governorate Council should plan a strategy to design and implement a strategy to ensure and promote the role of CSOs in fighting corruption.
- All government departments should be required to perform an examination of new hires and promoted employees to test awareness of the COC of the COI.

Training of Female PC Leaders, Washington, DC
IF delivered one training to Iraqi female provincial council leaders who were visiting the US.

- **Overview:** On March 21, 2010, the Iraq foundation represented by its COO Selwa Gailani, Senior Project Manager Maria Abousleiman, and Ali Ramadhan PAG project officer, delivered a training on transparency and anti-corruption to 15 Iraqi female provincial council leaders who were visiting the US as part of the Office of Global Women’s Issues at the State Department. The provincial council members were from Baghdad, Basra, Diyala, Maysan, Najaf, Salah ad-Din, Tameem, and Thi-Qar.

- **Topics:** All the participants have influential roles in their communities, are strong and active leaders on women’s issues, and are active members of provincial committees and/or leaders of non-governmental organizations. The training was delivered in the form of PowerPoint presentation (attached). In addition, each participant received a manual of the training material which contained the PowerPoint presentation, the Civil Servants Code of Conduct, copy of the Civic Servant Financial Interest Disclosure, Law of Compliance, and useful resources. IF is currently working with these women leaders as part of the selected participants for PAG training workshops in their respective governorates. Training covered the following topics:

  - The definition of corruption in its various forms and its negative effects;
  - Causes of corruption;
  - Types of corruption and how its spreads;
  - Methods to combat corruption;
  - Promotion of transparency;
  - The role of the official Iraqi agencies for documenting and fighting corruption, The Commission of Integrity (COI), Office of Financial Supervision and the Office of the Inspector General;
Delivering Computer Equipment to Iraqi Commission on Integrity

http://www.iraqfoundation.org/projects_new/pag/CPI-DonationNov09.htm

- In November 2009, IF delivered substantial technological equipment and computers to the Iraqi Commission of Integrity (COI). In total, the equipment was valued at over $180,000 US Dollars. IF aimed to dramatically enhance the COIs technical capacity to implement its work throughout Iraq. IF provided up-to-date computers, laser printers, projectors, backup systems, scanners, and a host of software suites designed to enhance productivity for the Commission.

US Embassy Meetings


- On July 14, 2010, Ms Al-Assadi and Ms. Mohammed attended a meeting organized by the ACCO of the US embassy, in Al-Rashed Hotel in Baghdad. During the meeting, IF staff were introduced to Ms. Patricia from Revenue Watch and to Mr. Sujey Kallumadana from IRI. PAG staff clarified the Project’s activities and coordination on future anti-corruption work was discussed with Mr. Kallumadana.

- On August 9, 2010, Ms Al-Assadi and Ms. Mohammed attended a meeting organized by the ACCO of the US embassy, in Al-Rashed Hotel in Baghdad. PAG staff explained PAG activities and accomplishments to Mr. Anthony Eterno. Coordination and collaboration between PAG staff and Mr. Eterno was discussed and planned.

- On August 10, 2010, Ms Al-Assadi and Ms. Mohammed attended an anti-corruption meeting in the US embassy in Baghdad. The meeting was mainly held to discuss Iraq’s anti-corruption strategy. The US ambassador in Baghdad and other senior anti-corruption officials were among the attendees. Dr. Kalid Al-Mamori, the Head of the Anti-Corruption Group explained the concepts, strategies, objectives, and timeline of Iraq’s anti-corruption strategy.
Throughout the project, IMGs of various provinces arranged a host of activities to raise awareness of the issue of corruption in the community.

- **On May 12, 2011**, the IMG of Basra province arranged a unique anti-corruption event. The event was a bicycle tour through the areas of Basra province. The cyclists were wearing white t-shirts written on the back of them “fighting corruption together”. The event was conducted in coordination with the authorities of the province; therefore, many policemen were deployed in the province to block the main streets and intersections in order to secure the route for the tour. Police vehicles and motorcycles also accompanied the tour from start to finish. Hundreds of people stood on the sides of the streets cheering the cyclists and chanting against corruption. The tour was organized to send a strong message against corruption in the province and to encourage everyone to collaborate against it. At the finish line, many government officials, NGO activist, IMG members, IF staff and police officers were waiting for the cyclists to greet them. This event had a very positive reaction in the province, because it was the first of its kind.

- **On May 23, 2011**, Ninawa IMG organized an anti-corruption drawing exhibition in the province. 116 anti-corruption drawings were displayed in the exhibition. Ninawa Deputy Governor, Mr. Hassan opened the exhibition which mainly included caricature drawings of Mr. Mahir Al-Ubidy, a famous caricature painter and an IMG member. Mr. Al-Ubidy interpreted his ideas about corruption his drawings. Many people and officials attend to the exhibition and commended the ideas of the drawings. Various media stations attended to the gallery (Al-Musuliya, Al-Shurqqiya, Al-Fihai, Al-Furat, Al-Rusheed, Sama)

- **During the month of September, 2011**, the IMG in Thi-Qar collected 1250 signatures from the general public to support passing the Access to Information Bill.
➢ Trained 570 civic leaders in 15 2-day TOTs on the Iraqi anti-corruption legal and regulatory framework.
➢ Trained 450 members of the provincial councils and other senior officials in 15 1-day trainings on the Code of Conduct and associated Law on Compliance and Disciplinary Action.
➢ Disseminated 15,000 posters and 25,000 pamphlets on the Code of Conduct and related compliance laws.
➢ Trained 120 civic leaders from 15 provinces on methodology and indicators for monitoring good governance in 4 4-day TOT workshops in Beirut, Lebanon.
➢ Translated GI Indicators into Arabic.
➢ Drafted Agendas for Change by civic leaders at TOT workshops in Beirut.
➢ Adoption of Agendas for Change in 15 provinces.
➢ Prepared 15 IMGs to engage in monitoring anti-corruption and transparency indicators and to establish cooperation with other civic groups, the media and the local government.
➢ Conducted 174 consultation meetings of the IMGs.
➢ 641 IMG members and local stakeholders reviewed progress of the Agenda for Change.
➢ Facilitated 90 quarterly town hall meetings in each province.
➢ Broadcasted 229 monthly radio talk shows with provincial officials.
➢ Produced and broadcasted 315 30-second spots on Al-Iraqiya TV station.
➢ Held 4 regional meetings of the IMGs.
➢ Produced anti-corruption networking website to serve the IMGs and the wider public.
➢ Printed 2,000 copies of the final Agenda for Change Report, and distributed 210 in the Press Conference on final report. IF intends to distribute the rest of 1,790 copies to the following entities: Integrity Commission, Judge Raheem Al-Ekaili, The US Embassy in Baghdad, Integrity Commission of the CoR, The Diwan of the Inspector General, MoJ, MOI, PAG teams, IF Office in DC and Baghdad, and other entities.
➢ Held press conference on final report attended by members of the provincial governments, representatives of IMGs, Committee on Integrity and Council of Representatives.
➢ Facilitated outreach activities.
➢ Coordinated 242 visits of members of IMGs to local provincial officials.
In order to assess the impact of the project, IF carried out site visits in order to supervise implementation and monitor progress. IF also received feedback from workshop, training, and meeting participants, some implementing partners, and the Iraqi general public. IF’s evaluation yielded the following results:

**Civic Leaders’ Workshops Feedback**

- Following the workshop, 80% of participants reported greater awareness of the regulatory and legal frameworks for combating corruption. Some mentioned interest in using this knowledge to hold anti-corruption training workshops for local government employees and different segments of local civil society.
- Participants also indicated that they were more prepared to assist IMGs in anti-corruption efforts and particularly in reporting incidences of corruption electronically by email or through a hotline in a manner that ensures confidentiality. Both of these reporting mechanisms were established as the result of the workshops.
- Participants reported a greater capacity to raise awareness among local community members regarding transparency and government accountability.

**Provincial Leaders’ Workshops Feedback**

- Participants praised the workshops’ emphasis on COC and the distribution of posters and pamphlets on the COC and associated compliance laws that govern the behavior of employees and employers. Participants from several provinces requested more posters and pamphlets (Baghdad, Najaf, Nineweh, Diyala, and Diwaniya).
- Participants extolled the significant increase in high-level officials that understand the significance of the COC and associated compliance laws. Similarly, participants indicated that more officials are now able to honor the COC among their employees.
- Many respondents requested that IF continue to hold workshops in this vein.

**ToT Workshop Assessments**

Respondents indicated the following outcomes as the most significant achievements of the workshop:

- Building capacity among civil society organizations in the field of corruption and government accountability through educating leaders on transparency indicators and the NAS
- Enabling CSO leaders to use local and global transparency indicators to combat corruption
- Bolstering cooperation and exchange between civil society leaders and government officials for the sake of adopting the necessary steps to combat corruption and adopt the agendas for change at the provincial level.
- Increasing awareness among civil society leaders regarding laws perpetuating corruption in order to put pressure on the local government and close the gap between local legislation and the NAS.

Respondents also rated different segments of the workshops. Results are indicated below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training Day: Session</th>
<th>Name of Workshop</th>
<th>% Rated Very Good</th>
<th>% Rated Good</th>
<th>% Rated Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Workshops’ Contents</td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:1</td>
<td>Basic concepts and global transparency indicators: What is the common denominator?</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:2</td>
<td>Transparency indicators and national principles</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:3</td>
<td>Are international agreements sufficient to combat corruption locally?: A UN case-study</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:1</td>
<td>Detailed review of the National Anti-Corruption Strategy</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:2</td>
<td>Detailed review of the national transparency indicators</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:3</td>
<td>Case Study: How is it possible to apply the National Anti-Corruption Strategy and national transparency indicators to six pillars in Iraq?</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:1</td>
<td>Moving from theory to application: How can a</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents also noted the following points on the surveys:
- The workshop was short but contained a lot of information.
- There was no activity-free day during the workshop.
- Each topic of the workshop needed more time to be covered in detail as many of them were complex and very important.
- More time was needed for discussions.
- Respondents appreciated receiving the NAS in hard-copy.

**LTA Feedback**
The LTA described the workshop as successful and noted the following accomplishments:
- Increased capacity of civil society leaders to use transparency indicators in the drafting of agendas for change
- Equipped civil society leaders with the expertise needed for the combating of corruption locally
Prepared IMG members to push for stronger laws to combat corruption through comparing legal frameworks of Lebanon and Iraq

Facilitated exchange of expertise among leaders of diverse backgrounds regarding the type and incidence of corruption in each province

Enabled collaboration on future steps, such as the establishment of a transparency committee in the provincial council of Mosul and Kirkuk, to combat corruption

**Radio Interviews and TV Spots**


In March 2011, IF designed and distributed a survey form to measure the impact of PAG TV spots in the provinces. The form was distributed to people of different backgrounds, educational level and gender in five of 15 provinces: Baghdad, Maysan, Thi Qar, Wasit and Karbala. 200 individuals responded to surveys in four of the provinces (Baghdad, Maysan, Thi Qar and Wasit) and 300 individuals responded to one province’s survey (Karbala) for a total of 1100 respondents. Demographic questions indicated a diversity of gender, age, and level of education. Survey results can be found below:

- 79% of respondents surveyed indicated that they had watched the TV spots.
- 56% indicated they had viewed the TV spots 1-10 times monthly, 35% 10-20 times and 9% 20-30 times.
- When asked if they believed that the TV spots increased the public’s awareness of the need to combat corruption, 75% responded positively.
- When asked to identify the group most affected by the TV spots, 44% of respondents indicated that the general public, 40% indicated government officials and the general public, 12% indicated government officials, and merely 4% indicated that they did not believe the TV spots to be effective.
- Respondents were asked to identify the most corrupt government institution that works directly with citizens. 28% indicated education, 31% indicated health, 31% indicated infrastructure, and 10% indicated “other.”
- When asked if they believed that the PAG TV spots were necessary to reduce corruption, 81% responded positively, 5% responded negatively and 14% indicated their belief that the programs were somewhat necessary.
- When asked if the corruption rate dropped as the result of the TV spots, 70% responded positively, 18% responded negatively and 12% indicated that they believed the corruption rate had dropped “somewhat.”
- Recommendations included:
  - Increasing broadcasting TV spots on more channels to reach a larger audience
As the result of IF’s radio programming, the number, frequency and type of communication between officials and citizens and access to public officials by the public were increased. Additionally, through participating in radio interviews, officials came to accept the need to communicate with the public.

**Town hall Meetings**
Participants indicated the following as the most significant achievements of the town hall meetings:
- Direct communication between governing officials, members of the media and the general public on real issues covered by local media (radio, TV, newspaper)
- Increased understanding among public officials on the need to collaborate with journalists and the general public to investigate corruption cases and devise necessary solutions
- Greater transparency of government activities
- Higher expectations of government officials among the general public
- Cooperation among government officials and the general public in the investigation of corruption cases
- Fostering of a sense of responsibility among citizens to conduct government monitoring activities

**CHALLENGES AND REMEDIAL ACTIONS**

Security concerns represented the most significant factor in project implementation, particularly in the Salah Al-Din and Kirkuk provinces. IF staff also faced many other challenges that they tried to overcome in different ways. Here are some examples:

- Poor internet and phone services hindering communication.
- Busy schedules of provincial council members caused workshops to be re-scheduled and made meetings difficult.
- Visa issues caused TOT workshops in Beirut to be re-scheduled.
- Some NGO partners had to be replaced during the project as they were not performing up to standard. In the October – December, 2010 reporting period, IF replaced implementing partners in Najaf, Kirkuk, and Salah Al-Din.
- **Observance of Religious Holidays:** Town hall meetings in January had to be deferred to February 2011; Town hall meetings in July 2011 also had to be delayed to September due to observance of Ramadan. Activities in November 2011 had to be re-scheduled.
CONCLUSION

Corruption presents one of the most serious obstacles facing Iraq today hindering the work of initiatives that aim to build a safe and democratic country for future generations. The goal of the PAG project was to increase the capacity of Iraqi civil society at the provincial level to implement anti-corruption measures, promote government accountability and transparency, and enable civil society to conduct oversight of government institutions on a range of corruption issues. IF’s role was to select partner organizations with the relevant expertise in each of the provinces of implementation to assist in carrying out the project’s activities. IF assisted in the formation of integrity monitoring groups, draft agendas for change and facilitate the adoption of these agendas in each of the provinces. The strong leadership of provincial IMGs led to the establishment of a coalition to combat corruption entitled, “the National Network for Transparency and Monitoring of Corruption (NNTMC)” in October 2011. The Iraq Foundation will continue to support initiatives that aim to combat corruption in Iraq even following the conclusion of this project.